

Research Note: Buddhism in the Writings of Tao Hongjing

Stephen R. Bokenkamp

Abstract

This research note presents two bits of evidence that indicate we should reconsider our received idea that Buddhist elements came into Daoist scriptures in a major way only with the early 5th-century Lingbao scriptures. The two examples presented here indicate that ideas of rebirth and an expansive cosmos composed of alternate world-systems not only appeared in the writings of Tao Hongjing, but also with the Shangqing scriptures that he collected and annotated. The bad news for modern researchers is that the examples presented here also show that such traces of Buddhist borrowings were systematically removed from Daoist scripture beginning as early as the late 6th century.

Keywords: Tao Hongjing, Buddhism, Shangqing, textual analysis, Dunhuang

Stephen R. Bokenkamp is Professor of Chinese at Arizona State University and the author of numerous studies on the relations between Buddhism and Daoism in early medieval China, including *Ancestors and Anxiety: Daoism and the Birth of Rebirth in China*.

Over the last decades of research into Daoism, we have come to agree on a rather simple timeline for the adoption of Buddhist elements into Daoist scripture. I myself have helped to develop and perpetuate this view, which began with Erik Zürcher's observation, in his 1980 "Buddhist Influence on Early Taoism," that "the lion's share of Buddhist loans of all types and levels is concentrated in the scriptures of the Lingbao tradition."¹ The timeline we drew from Zürcher's initial observation portrays Celestial Master Daoism as almost entirely free from Buddhist elements, Shangqing scriptures with a bit more (mostly ornamental in nature), and the Lingbao scriptures as the first real attempt to deal with the imported religion of Buddhism.²

The two examples I present here indicate that it might be time to reconsider this timeline. In addition, they suggest some rather unpleasant possibilities for the textual study of Daoism.

I. Item One

During the course of my translation of the *Declarations of the Perfected* 真誥 (DZ 1016; hereafter as *Declarations*), I regularly checked citations for character variants. In the *Jade Slips of Great Clarity on the Ultimate Dao of the Celestial Luminaries* 天皇至道太清玉冊 (DZ 1483; hereafter as *Jade Slips*), I came across the following passage:

大方諸之東，小方諸上，多奇寶，甚靈異。有玉酒金漿在馬 [= 焉]。³
 青帝君畜積天寶之器物，盡在於此。亦多有仙人，食不死草，飲此酒漿，身作金玉色，常多吹九靈簫以自娛樂。能吹簫者，聞四十里。簫有三十孔，竹長二三尺。九簫同唱，百獸抃舞，鳳凰群至，鳴舞以和簫聲。此國之樂也，與西胡之佛法大不侔矣。西胡之法謂吹大法螺、

¹ Erik Zürcher, "Buddhist Influence on Early Taoism: A Survey of Scriptural Evidence," *T'oung pao* 66.1/3 (1980): 147.

² For later elaborations of this view, see, for instance, Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation du Shangqing dans l'histoire du taoïsme* (Paris: Publications de l'École Française d'Extrême-Orient, #137, 1984), 2:87–104, and Stephen R. Bokenkamp, *Ancestors and Anxiety: Daoism and the Birth of Rebirth in China* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2007), 158–198.

³ The final two graphs of this sentence do not appear in DZ 1016.

擊大法鼓。其樂不同，況其法也。《涅槃經》云：「生滅滅矣，寂滅為樂。」是以生為幻，死為樂。方諸國以生為樂，死為患也。故稱佛法，不稱佛道。出《真誥》。(2.60a–b)

After working out the variants from DZ 1016, the received Zhen'gao, I translated this as follows:

On the Lesser Fangzhu to the east of Greater Fangzhu there are many exceedingly strange and numinous treasures. There are white jade ales and golden liquor pools.⁴ Lord Azure has here amassed precious celestial goods. There are also many Transcendents who eat the herbs of deathlessness and drink the naturally occurring ales and liquors, so that their bodies thereby emit a golden, jadelike gleam. They always blow Nine Numinosities flutes to amuse themselves. Those who are adepts can make the flute music audible for a distance of forty *li*. The flute has thirty openings and is made of bamboo segments of two or three feet in length. When they play in unison, the hundred beasts stamp and dance and several tens of phoenix pairs come to harmonize with the music.⁵

[Tao Hongjing 陶弘景 (456–536) note:] The Buddhist practice of the Western Hu peoples is greatly different. The western Hu “blow the conch of the law and strike the drum of the law.”⁶ Their music thus differs and their practices differ even more. The *Nirvāna Scripture* states: “When life is obliterated it is obliteration with no remainder – Total obliteration is bliss.”⁷ In this way, Buddhists take life to be an

⁴ “White Jade Ale” appears in some versions of the *Traditions of Child-of-Heaven Mu* 穆天子傳. See the citation at *Taiping yulan* 太平御覽, 696.2a. The *Daozang* version (DZ 291), 2.1b has a lacuna where “ale” should appear.

⁵ The last lines paraphrase a passage from the “Yiji” 益稷 chapter of the *Shangshu* 尚書: “When the nine parts of the Shao music for reed pipes are played, the phoenixes come in stately formation. Kui said: ‘Oh! When I strike the stones or gently tap the stone the hundred beasts lead one another to dance’” 籥韶九成，鳳皇來儀。夔曰：於！予擊石拊石，百獸率舞。 *Shisanjing zhushu* 十三經注疏 edition, 1:144a–b.

⁶ This phrase about “dharma conches” 法螺 and “dharma drums” 法鼓 shows up in several early Buddhist scriptures.

⁷ I translate the text as given “生滅滅矣，寂滅為樂” despite the fact that the likely sources, *Mahāparinirvāna-sūtra* 大般涅槃經 (T.7), 1.204c22, or T.375, 12.693a1, both read “生滅滅已，寂滅為樂.” Still, this is not the way that a contemporary Buddhist would have interpreted this passage. Stefano Zacchetti kindly offers his own version: “Once birth and extinction are extinguished, [their] quiet appeasement is a joy!” Personal communication, 20 November, 2013.

illusion and regard death as a joyful thing. On Fangzhu, life is blissful and death is a calamity. This is why [Buddhists] call their practices “the methods of the Buddha” and not “the Way of the Buddha.”⁸

—From the *Declarations of the Perfected*

Nothing approximating the passage beginning with my insertion of the heading “Tao Hongjing note” appears in received copies of the *Declarations*. Absent this “note,” the Lesser Fangzhu to the east seems to be entirely occupied by Daoist deities, while the Lesser Fangzhu to the west is occupied by Buddhist-leaning Daoist deities.⁹ Since Tao Hongjing’s annotation is so copious throughout this section, the absence of notes at this spot in the received *Declaration* seems odd.

In fact, the passage I set off as a “note” is not even marked as such in the source that provides it, the *Jade Slips*, an encyclopedic collection by Zhu Quan 朱權 (1378–1448), seventeenth son of Ming Taizu 明太祖 (r. 1368–1398).¹⁰ Instead, the paragraph follows without separation on the previous paragraph, which is attested in DZ 1016, the canonical *Declarations*. As I have indicated in my transcription, the entire passage is explicitly indicated as deriving from the *Declarations*. The suspect note is unlikely to be from Yang Xi’s hand, however, since it cites the *Nirvāna Scripture* that was brought to China in 414 and subsequently translated by Faxian 法顯 in 417–418.¹¹ Whatever the Buddhist source of this citation, the

⁸ I am uncertain as to the subject of this sentence. Both Yang Xi 楊羲 and Tao Hongjing use the term “Way of the Buddha.” It seems, then, that the remark is based on normal Buddhist usage. Buddhists also often called their religion “the Way of the Buddha,” but they used *fa* 法 (dharma) in a way that would have seemed strange.

⁹ The passage on the Lesser Fangzhu to the west begins, “There are many followers of the Buddha’s way there. There are Buddha [images] inlaid with gold and jades” 多有奉佛道者，有浮圖以金玉鏤之。 See *Zhen’gao*, 9.21a–b.

¹⁰ On this work, see Kristofer Schipper and Franciscus Verellen, eds., *The Taoist Canon: A Historical Companion to the Daozang* (Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 2004), 2:947–948. As Schipper notes, the preface to this work is dated 1444 and it shows signs of sloppy editing.

¹¹ See Erik Zürcher, *The Buddhist Conquest of China* (Leiden: Brill, 1959), 1:105. According to Jan Nattier, another possible early source is the so-called Southern version (T.375), i.e., the revision of Dharmakṣema’s 曇無讖 (T.374) by Huiyan 慧嚴 / Jñānabhadra 若那跋陀羅 et al. Personal communication.

passage containing it most likely represents a note that was cut from Tao Hongjing's work.

There are several factors that might support this hypothesis:

(1) The received *Declarations* treats the Lesser Fangzhu isles of the east and the west as mirror images of one another. They are the residences of "mid-level Perfected" 中仙人.¹² Thus, if one is occupied by Buddhist types, the other should be as well.

(2) The fact that the bodies of the celestial beings resident here "emit a golden, jadelike gleam" 身作金玉色 recalls the tale of Emperor Ming's dream of the Buddha whose body emitted a white gleam (身有白光) in the recounting just previous to this in the text.¹³ The muted criticism that their bodies gleam only because they ingest the naturally occurring alchemical products of the floating isle accords with what the *Declarations* says of the Buddhist Perfected of the Lesser Fangzhu of the west. "They all consume the essences of the five planets and recite the *Return to the Storehouse Scripture* of the Xia dynasty and by this means are able to travel by flying."¹⁴ It is thus likely that these are also "celestial Buddhists," despite the fact that the received *Declarations* does not mention this detail at all.

(3) Tao Hongjing, the man who collected and annotated the *Declarations*, was quite interested in this other-worldly geography and annotated each paragraph fairly fully. Only this paragraph remains un-annotated in the canonical *Declarations*. Our suspect passage would thus represent his scholarly response to the musical

¹² DZ 1016, 9.20b–21a.

¹³ DZ 1016, 9.19b.

¹⁴ DZ 1016, 9.20a. Tao actually compares the deities of this Lesser Fangzhu, with their Chinese garb, to the "three disciples" who, he claims, were known as "Perfected Bodhisattvas" 真菩薩. This is a reference to the Buddhist scriptures written in China that claimed early Chinese sages to be disciples of the Buddha. Daoan 道安 (fl. 570), in his "Treatise on the Two Teachings" 二教論, cites one example, a *Scripture on the Dharma Practices of Stillness and Purity* 清淨法行經 as follows: "The Buddha sent his three disciples to Zhendan 振旦 (= China) to proselytize. There was the Bodhisattva Scholarly Lad 儒童菩薩 who was called Confucius, the Brilliant and Pure Bodhisattva 光淨菩薩, who was Yan Yuan 顏淵 (Confucius's disciple), and *Mahākāśyapa* 摩訶, who was Laozi 老子." (T.2103, 8.140a4–8) Naturally, these Chinese culture heroes were not thought to have worn Buddhist clothing.

proclivities of the deities resident on the easternmost Lesser Fangzhu. One can hardly imagine him to have been silent on the subject.

Of course, none of these proofs are conclusive. It also boggles the imagination that an unexpurgated copy of the *Declarations* should have remained unremarked until the fifteenth century. In addition, Zhu Quan's animus toward Buddhism is well attested, as is his intense personal practice of Daoism. He just might have written such a passage and misrepresented it as having come from the *Declarations*.

But we also know that Zhu Quan had a substantial Daoist library, portions of which he copied into his *Secret Writings on Origins* 原始秘書 and later into the *Jade Slips*.¹⁵ He just might have owned such a unique manuscript of the *Declarations*. Another bit of circumstantial evidence supporting my reading is that, despite his negative views on Buddhism, Zhu Quan shows no awareness of the actual content of their scriptures. Nowhere else in his *Jade Slips* does he cite a Buddhist scripture. I know that *ex nihilo, nihil fit*, but it seems striking that Zhu Quan should cite even a fragment of Buddhist verse here when he does not do so elsewhere. Tao Hongjing does, however, cite Buddhist texts.¹⁶

Finally, however, it is prudent to admit the origin of our suspect paragraph seems a matter that cannot be definitively decided. I will have a few suggestions as to how we might deal with such cases in the conclusion to this note.

It is worth noting before we move on that the stance toward Buddhism found in the surviving *Declarations* passage and that seen in the hypothetical Tao's note that glosses it have much in common. In both, the author proves knowledgeable with regard to the contemporary image of the foreign faith, but asserts its dependence on Daoist practice and gives it a decidedly lower

¹⁵ On Zhu Quan and his engagement with Daoist book culture, see Richard G. Wang, *The Ming Prince and Daoism: Institutional Patronage of an Elite* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2012), especially xi–xix. In a personal communication (22 December 2013), Wang points out that our suspicious fragment is indeed something that Zhu Quan might have written.

¹⁶ See, for instance, the long note at DZ 1016, 15.5a, in which Tao displays his knowledge of Buddhist purgatories.

valuation. We will find that the same combination of knowledge and mild animus in another lost fragment more conclusively from the brush of Tao Hongjing.

II. Item Two

In my “Simple Twists of Fate? The Daoist Body and Its *Ming*,”¹⁷ I followed Robinet in exploring briefly the fascinating meditation through which a Daoist might remake his or her body by literally bringing it back to the moment of conception. The text on which I based my argument turns out not to have been the earliest one. The “Nine Perfected” 九真 meditation technique of the canonical *Central Scripture of the Nine Perfected* (*Jiuzhen zhongjing* 九真中經, DZ 1376; hereafter as *Nine Perfected*) was *not* written by Yang Xi (330–ca. 386). Rather, it is a more complicated version of the original composed between 536 and 580. I can make this assertion with some confidence. That is because, as part of my current project—the translation into English of the 真誥—I had occasion to review the Dunhuang 敦煌 manuscripts S.4314, S.6193, P.2751 that Ōfuchi Ninji 大淵忍爾 long ago identified as part of a single document to which he gave the name “紫文行事決” (hereafter as *Xingshi jue*).¹⁸

It is now clear to me that this Dunhuang document is indisputably a missing part of Tao Hongjing’s *Dengzhen yinjue* 登真隱訣 (Concealed Instructions on the Ascent to Perfection, DZ 421; hereafter as *Concealed Instructions*).¹⁹ The *Concealed Instructions* was originally a work in 24 chapters, divided into nine sections, as Tao himself claims in his appendix to the *Declarations*. While there is no chapter number on any of the Dunhuang fragments and they

¹⁷ Stephen R. Bokenkamp, “Simple Twists of Fate? The Daoist Body and Its *Ming*,” in *The Magnitude of Ming: Command, Allotment, and Fate in Chinese Culture*, ed. Christopher Lupke (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2005), 151–168.

¹⁸ Ōfuchi Ninji, *Tonkō Dōkyō, Mokuroku hen* 敦煌道經·目錄篇 (Tokyo: Fukutake, 1978), 1:183–185. I will cite this document in the *Zhonghua dao zang* 中華道藏 edition (hereafter as ZH ed.), giving volume, page number, register, and line.

¹⁹ Ursula-Angelika Cedzich was the first to come to this conclusion, see note 20. The reasons I provide for claiming these manuscripts as part of the *Concealed Instructions* are my own, not Cedzich’s.

do not mention the *Concealed Instructions*, they clearly form part of it.

Scholars who have studied this question have noticed that the *Xingshi jue* seems related to the *Concealed Instructions*, but have all concluded that the fragments represent a different work, abbreviated from the *Concealed Instructions*. The reason they give is precisely the apparently altered form of the *Nine Perfected* found in the *Xingshi jue*.²⁰ My contention is that the Dunhuang fragments represent something close to the original text of the *Concealed Instructions*. At the same time, these fragments show the canonical *Nine Perfected* to be an altered version of the original.

Here are the reasons for my claim:

(1) The format of the Dunhuang *Xingshi jue* matches that of the three extant chapters of the *Concealed Instructions*. The notes attached to the *Xingshi jue* are sometimes quite lengthy and, in the manner of Tao's other annotations, include editorial corrections and even suggestions as to how the text came to be corrupt.²¹

²⁰ In her "Dengzhen yinjue," Angelika Cedzich reaches the following conclusion with regard to the Dunhuang fragments: "Thus we may conclude that the Dunhuang manuscript does not represent an independent *Ziwen xingshi jue* 紫文行事訣 in one juan with seven sections, but rather the fragment of a juan from the *Dengzhen yinjue* that contained the subsections six (*Ziwen*) and seven (*Jiuzhen zhongjing*) within a larger chapter (on visualization, *cunxiang* 存想? [note: the Chinese character should be "想"]) of that work. If we take into account the abbreviated rendering of some passages and, especially in the second part of the fragment, the relatively brief annotations, it is also possible that the Dunhuang copy, similar to 424 *Shangqing mingtang yuanzhen jingjue* (q.v.), already represents a somewhat revised version of Tao's original text." See Ursula-Angelika Cedzich, "Dengzhen yinjue," in *The Taoist Canon*, 1:203–205. Wang Jiakui 王家葵 holds that the *Xingshi jue* is unlikely to be a part of the original *Concealed Instructions* because the "title" does not fit the two word standard of *Concealed Instructions* section headings. He further argues that the "method of Nine Perfected [meditation]" is abbreviated from the canonical *Central Scripture of the Nine Perfected*." See Wang Jiakui, *Dengzhen yinjue jijiao* 登真隱訣輯校 (Beijing: Zhonghua shuju, 2011), 21 and 236n3.

²¹ See for example, 紫文行事訣, ZH ed., 2.358a21–23: "I note that the former two references to the name give *Jianyu*, while the incantation has *Yujian*. Perhaps this is a mistake, but juxtaposition in addressing [gods?] is also one type [of incantation practice?], so we should follow [the text as given]. Also, the graph *cun* 存 has been written *zai* 在. This is also a mistake" 案前二名皆云堅玉，而此祝云玉堅，或當是誤，然反覆呼此，猶為一類，今但當依之。又存字作在，亦是誤耳。

(2) Like the extant *Concealed Instructions*, the *Xingshi jue* gives the number of rhymes 韻 for each of the rhymed sections. This is very fortunate, since it allows us to see what was added to the *Nine Perfected*. For example, in the very first incantation found in the *Xingshi jue* section that will serve as my example, we find the following (Passages from the Dunhuang manuscript *Xingshi jue* will below be marked [XSJ] and those from the canonical *Nine Perfected* will be marked [NP]. Significant differences between the two will be underlined for emphasis.):

[XSJ] 祝曰：「天精大君，來見心中，身披朱衣，頭巾丹冠，左佩神書，右帶虎文，口吐紫華，養心凝魂，赤藏自生，得為飛仙。」五韻。畢乃開目。²²

The incantation states: “Great Lord of Celestial Essence, come to appear in my heart. Wearing your crimson robe, your head scarfed with cinnabar crown; to the left you wear at your belt spiritual writings, to the right tiger texts. Your mouth spews purple floescence to nourish my heart and solidify my cloudsouls. The red organ (= my heart) is renewed of itself and I will become a flying Transcendent.” [Tao note:] Five rhymes. When you have finished, open your eyes.

[NP] 祝曰：「天精大君，飛生上英，帝君內化，來見心中，身披朱衣，頭巾丹冠，左佩龍書，右帶虎文，和精三道，合神上元，五靈奉符，與帝同全，口吐紫華，養心凝神，赤藏自生，得為飛仙。」²³

The incantation states: “Great Lord of Celestial Essence, upper blossom that flies to give life, Lord Thearch who transforms internally, come to appear in my heart. Wearing your crimson robe, your head scarfed with cinnabar crown; to the left you wear at your belt dragon writings, to the right tiger texts. You harmonize essences along the three paths, joining spiritually above with the Upper Prime. The five spirits reverently present talismans, joining entirely with the Thearch. Your mouth spews purple floescence to nourish my heart and solidify my cloudsouls. The red organ (= my heart) is renewed of itself and I will become a flying Transcendent.”

²² ZH ed., 2.357b–358a.

²³ DZ 1376, 1.3b.

This shows clearly that the incantation in the received *Nine Perfected* scripture contains three more rhyme-words than the version Tao saw.

(3) Finally, and I think most conclusively, Tao himself mentions an aspect of the Nine Perfected meditation found in the *Xingshi jue* in the surviving chapters of the *Concealed Instructions*. According to the *Xingshi jue* version of the Nine Perfected meditation, the god of the lungs is Lord White Prime 白元君 and the god of the head is Lord Nonpareil 無英君. Another of the scriptures that Tao annotates in the surviving chapters of the *Concealed Instructions* deals with the gods of the Nine Palaces 九宮 of the brain. Both White Prime and Nonpareil figure there as gods of the head. Here is what Tao has to say of this in the surviving chapters of the *Concealed Instructions*. First the text Tao is glossing and then his annotation:

洞房中有三真。左為無英公子，右為白元君，中為黃老君，三人共治洞房中。此飛真之道，別自有經。按，此三真是洞房之常神，而《九真》乃使假化離合。白元無英，合為一真。又白元在肺，不入洞房。且方諸玉字，止黃老一君而已。²⁴

Within the Cavern Chamber are three Perfected. To the left is Gentleman Nonpareil, to the right is Lord White Prime, and in the middle is Lord Yellow Ancient. These three all rule from within the Cavern Chamber [of the head].

[Tao Hongjing] note: These three Perfected are gods regularly resident in the Cavern Chamber, yet the [Central Scripture of the] *Nine Perfected* causes them to provisionally transform, separating and joining. White Prime and Nonpareil are joined together as a single Perfected being. Also, [in this scripture] White Prime is in the lungs and does not even enter into the Cavern Palace. Moreover, [according to] the jade graphs of Fangzhu, only Lord Yellow Ancient is there.²⁵

So, according to Tao's remarks here, the original *Nine Perfected* provisionally takes these deities as aspects of a single deity for its meditation. As we will see, the received canonical version of the

²⁴ DZ 421, ZH ed., 2.249b7–12.

²⁵ I am not certain what the “jade graphs of Fangzhu” might be. Perhaps Tao refers to a part of the original *Nine Perfected* text that has been edited out of the received text.

text fixes the conflicting deity names that Tao notices by creating new names for the gods of the lungs and the head. In addition, it concocts a more complex physiology by which the “Nine Perfected” are compound deities formed of the cloudsouls (*hun* 魂) of a great deity joined with other bodily deities through meditation.

And here we come to the crux of the matter that will already have occurred to the reader. What is so different about this original version of the *Nine Perfected*? Why were such changes made? The answer to these questions is as surprising as it is unexpected.

First, let us recall what we now have. If my analysis has merit, we have representatives of three recognizable stages in the development of the received, canonical copy of the *Nine Perfected*: (1) the original of Yang Xi, represented by the Dunhuang *Xingshi jue* [XSJ]; (2) Tao’s annotations to this text also recorded in the *Xingshi jue* found in Dunhuang; (3) The canonical *Nine Perfected* written by an unknown individual between Tao’s writing and the time of the *Wushang miyao* 無上祕要.²⁶ This is particularly valuable in that, as Robinet notes, all of the later citations of this text, from the *Wushang miyao* on, are drawn from (3). And we can, I think, hypothesize reasons for the changes at each stage.

The major difference in (3) over (1) is that the meditation procedure is made *much* more complex. The first of the nine meditations, that centering on the heart, will make this clear (As above, significant differences between the two texts will be underlined.):

[XSJ] 第一真法，平旦太神在心內，號曰天精君。

The first method of the Perfected: At sunrise, the Great Spirit is within your heart, styled the Lord of Celestial Essence.

[NP] 第一真法，以正月本命日、甲子、甲戌日平旦，帝君、太一、五神壹共混合，變為一大神，在心之內。號曰天精君，字飛生上英，貌如嬰兒始生之狀。

The first method of the Perfected: At sunrise on your natal day of the first month, on *jiazi* or *jiaxu* days, the Lord Thearch merges into one with Grand Unity [and the remaining] five spirits, transforming into a

²⁶ For an abstract of the *Jiuzhen zhongjing* that matches the god names of the canonical version, see *Wushang miyao* (DZ 1138), 5.9b–11a.

single Great Spirit within your heart, styled the Lord of Celestial Essence. He has the byname Shangying and is in appearance like a newly-born babe.

[XSJ] 平旦，接手於兩膝上，閉炁，冥目，內視。

At daybreak, join your hands on your knees, seal your breath, close your eyes, and look within.

[NP] 是其日平旦，當入室，接手於兩膝上，閉氣，冥目，內視。

At daybreak on these days, you should enter your chamber, join your hands on your knees, seal your breath, close your eyes, and look within.

[XSJ] 存天精君座在心中。

Visualize the Lord of Celestial Essence seated within your heart.

[NP] 存天精君坐在心中，號曰大神。

Visualize the Lord of Celestial Essence seated within your heart. He is called the “Great Spirit.”

[XSJ] 使大神口出紫炁，以繞心外九重。

Cause the mouth of the Great Spirit to issue forth purple *qi* that will wrap nine times around your heart.

[NP] 使大神口出紫氣，鬱然以繞我心外九重；氣上衝泥丸中，內外如一。

Cause the mouth of the Great Spirit to issue forth purple *qi* that will, in shadowy profusion, wrap nine times around your heart. The *qi* will shoot above into the Niwan (palace of your brain) and will be uniform within and without.

[XSJ] 畢，因叩齒九下，咽唾九過。

When [this visualization] is accomplished, knock your teeth nine times and swallow saliva nine times.

[NP] 畢，因叩齒九通，咽液九過。

When [this visualization] is accomplished, knock your teeth nine times and swallow saliva nine times.²⁷

²⁷ Comparing *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2.357b24–c24 with DZ 1376, 1.3a7–b3.

As the comparison shows clearly, the major difference between the two is that the original text (1) has one deity, called the “Great Spirit” 太神 who might be caused to reside in nine different parts of the body under different names (see the table below). This procedure recalls early meditations on the nine forms of the deified Laozi, etc.²⁸

The identity of the gods *taiyi wushen* 太一五神 added in version (3) are easy to explain. The phrase means “Grand Unity and the others of the Five Spirits” (*taiyi deng wushen* 太一等五神). These are the five spirits recorded on one’s register 籙 according to the *Shangqing Perfected Scripture of the Great Cavern* 上清大洞真經. They are: Grand Unity (head), Nonpareil (liver), White Prime (lungs), Director of Destiny 司命 (heart) and Peach Vigor 桃康 (navel).²⁹

As we already noticed, Tao Hongjing points out in one of the surviving three chapters of his *Dengzhen yinjue* that two of the spirits, Nonpareil and White Prime, reside in the palaces of the head according to another Shangqing text. So, the author of version (3) has corrected the errors in deity names that Tao Hongjing noted, changing Lord White Prime and Lord Nonpareil to Lord White Jade of the Upper Prime 上元素玉君 and Lord Upper Luminary of Thearchical Glory 帝昌上皇君, respectively (see the table below). These new names clearly do not fit the three-graph model of the original deity names. He has also added the bodily five deities for each of the nine stages of the visualization. According to this new version, they are to merge with yet another cosmic deity, the Lord Thearch 帝君, to create the Great Spirit.

²⁸ On these, see Anna K. Seidel, *La divinisation de Lao tseu dans le Taoïsme des Han* (Paris: École Française d’Extrême-Orient, 1969), 92ff.

²⁹ Isabelle Robinet, *Taoist Meditation: The Mao-shan Tradition of Great Purity*, trans. Julian F. Pas and Norman J. Girardot (Albany: State University of New York Press, 1993), 146.

Month	Body Parts for each Month from <i>Nine Perfected</i>	Style Name of Great Spirit from Dunhuang Manuscript	Style Name of Cloud Souls of Great Spirit from Canonical Version
一	心-火	天精君	天精君
二	骨	堅玉君	堅玉君
三	血	元生君	元生君
四	肝-木	青明君	青明君
五	脾-土	養光君	養光君
六	肺-金	白元君	上元素玉君
七	腎-水	玄陽君	玄陽君
八	膽	含景君	含景君
九	泥丸	無英君	帝昌上皇君

But why was it thought necessary to renovate this meditation practice? A probable answer appears in the changes version (3) made to the introduction to this meditation practice:

[XSJ] 人體有尊神，其居無常，展轉榮輸，流注元津。此神外來，內結以立一身，非如三魂七魄，是積靈受炁，生於父母者也。

Within the human body, there is a venerated spirit. Its residence is not fixed. It expands and revolves, grows vigorous and withers away. Its flowing irrigates with primal liquids. This spirit comes from outside [the body], but fastens itself within to establish the whole body. It is not like the three cloudsouls or the seven whitesouls. These latter are an assemblage of numinous powers that receive *qi* and were born from one's father and mother.

[NP] 人體有尊神，其居無常，出入乎上、中、下三田，迴易陰陽，去故納新，展轉榮輸，流注元津。大神虛生，內結以成一身，濯質化鍊，變景光明。³⁰ 非如三魂七魄，是精靈受氣，自生於人父母者也。

Within the human body, there is a venerated spirit. Its residence is not fixed. It enters and exits the three [cinnabar] fields—upper, middle and lower—revolves and changes with yin and yang, expelling the old [*qi*] and taking in the new. It expands and revolves, grows vigorous and withers away. Its flowing irrigates with primal liquids. The Great Spirit is born in the void, but fastens itself within to establish the whole body. It cleanses the physical form, refining it through transformation

³⁰ Cited in *Wushang miyao*, 5.3a–b.

and making the phosphors bright.³¹ It is not like the three cloudsouls or the seven whitesouls. These latter are an assemblage of numinous powers that receive *qi* and were born from one's father and mother.

[XSJ] 尊神有九名，号曰九真君，分化上下，轉形萬道，子能修之，則出水入火，五藏自生。

The venerated spirit has nine names, known as the Nine Perfected Lords. They divide and transform in the upper and lower regions of the body, transforming shapes in myriads of ways. If you are able to cultivate them, you may emerge unscathed from water or enter fire and your five viscera will be born of themselves.

[NP] 帝君九魂，變形一時，忽為尊神，有九名，號曰九真君，此太一帝君之混合而一變也，分為上下，旁適萬道。子能修之，則出水入火，五臟常生。

The Lord Thearch has nine cloudsouls that change form for a time. When suddenly they become the venerated spirits they have nine names, known as the Nine Perfected Lords. Each of these is a single transformation [formed from] the merging of Grand Unity [and the rest] with the Lord Thearch. They divide and transform in the upper and lower regions of the body, moving vertically into the myriads of ways. If you are able to cultivate them, you may emerge unscathed from water or enter fire and your five viscera will have extended life.³²

In this section, the major differences regard the identity of the “Great Spirit” or “venerated spirit” 尊神. The *Xingshi jue* (1) holds that it comes “from outside” and not from the birth parents. The canonical version (3) keeps these aspects, but emphasizes the immateriality and changeability of the spirit even further. It is “born of the void” 虛生 and its celestial credentials are further underlined through its status as a transformation of the Lord Thearch and Grand Unity 太一帝君. Finally, (3) insists that the “cloudsouls” of the spirit are “temporary” transformations 變形一時, not constant residents in the body. This is presumably why they are made to merge with spirits that do reside in the body to do their work.

³¹ The “phosphors” 景 are another set of important deities in Shangqing scriptures. They are 24 in number and divided into eight each in the upper, middle, and lower reaches of the body.

³² Comparing *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2.357b9–16 with DZ 1376, 1.2b6–3a5.

But the most suggestive changes appear in the last part of the introduction:

[XSJ] 長齋隱栖，以存其真。道齋謂之守靜，佛齋謂之耽晨。道靜接手於兩膝，佛晨合手於口前。

When one carries out a long retreat, residing in seclusion in order to visualize the true, it is called “maintaining stillness” when a Daoist Retreat and “Danchen” when it is Buddhist. Daoists in stillness join their hands on their knees; Buddhists in the morning (= *chen*) join their hands in front of their mouths.

[NP] 長齋隱栖，以存其真。此文一名《九真內訣》，一名《太上飛文》，一名《外國放品》，一名《神州靈章》。雖有四名，故一寶書耳。

One carries out a long retreat, residing in seclusion in order to visualize the true. This text is titled the *Inner Instructions of the Nine Perfected*; another name is *Flying Text of the Most High*; another name is the *Chapters on the Placement of the Outer Kingdoms*;³³ another name is the *Numinous Strophes of the Spirit Isles*. Though it has these four names, it is originally the same precious writing.³⁴

The major difference here is that the author of the canonical version (3) has completely deleted the version (1) references to Buddhism. I have no information on what 耽晨 might have meant in a Buddhist context. It does not look like a transliteration. Tao Hongjing glosses it as meaning *dhyāna* 思禪 and so it might be the name of a morning meditation, but I have been unable to locate further references. At any rate, it is a very good indication that the author of version (1) held this to be a method for which the Buddhists had their own version. There is not, to my knowledge, a Buddhist meditation for remaking the body according to the timing of fetal development, but Tao Hongjing connects the Nine Perfected meditation to Buddhism in another way. His gloss to this last passage in fact has wide-reaching implications for the study of Daoist history. He writes:

³³ Isabelle Robinet translates “*fangpin*” 放品 as “goods deposited.” See Isabelle Robinet, “*Shangqing waiguo fangpin jing*,” in *The Taoist Canon*, 1:149–150. In that this text shows clear Buddhist influence, I think we should understand the word “品” to mean “chapter” as in Buddhist translations.

³⁴ *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2.357b14–16 compared to DZ 1376, 1.3a3–6.

This seems to describe a luminous retreat. When one joins one's hands and observes in stillness, the masses of bodily spirits are spontaneously made bright; when one joins palms and concentrates with eyes open, the images of the body can be penetrated. These are the true attainments of Daoism and Buddhism; the orthodox methods of their two sorts of Retreat. Now, as a Dao, Buddhism is but one technique. When one forgets the body to maintain spirits, that is also the height of wondrous action. Danchen is what is today called "dhyāna." The Jade Luminary and Liuqin are the same image born of the mysterious essences. The Red Lord of the Southern Marchmount changed his garb to accord with his teachings.³⁵ In the realms of Fangzhu, those who honor [the Buddha] are half the population.³⁶ The disciples of the Three Perfected regard the two studies (Daoism and Buddhism) as equivalent.³⁷ In this way there are inner and outer aspects of the techniques and both similarities and differences of method. It is not that the ways of Chinese are totally distinct from those of Rong westerners or that this is a distinction between refined and rude. Rather it is the case that the border regions are rough and [its populace] scattered, thus it is appropriate that they employ a vast body of scripture. The Central Xia realm is refined and [its populace] dense, so we honor that which is profound and subtle.³⁸

[XSJ] 此蓋明齋之為義也。接手靜觀則百神自朗，合掌耽念則身相具微，斯道佛之真致，二齋之正軌。夫佛之為道，乃道之一法，忘形守神，亦妙之極也。耽晨，即今所謂思禪者矣。玉皇留秦，玄精同象，南岳赤君，隨教改服。方諸者之境，奉之者半，三真弟子，兩學相若，此乃術有內外，法有異同，本非華戎之隔，精粗之殊也。而邊國剛踈，故宜用其宏經；中夏柔密，所以遵其淵微耳。

Tao takes the passage in (1) to mean that the Nine Perfected meditation method is nearly identical to a Buddhist practice of

³⁵ Tao notes that "the central chapter of the *Mysterious Record of the Seven Sages* says that when the Red Lord brought down his teachings, he changed his traces to be a monk. He revealed his names to the world together with his six disciples" 《七聖玄紀中》云：赤君下教變迹作沙門，與六弟子俱皆顯姓名也。 *Zhen'gao*, 14.19a.

³⁶ See *Zhen'gao*, 9.21a. These passages were dealt with above.

³⁷ According to the *Zhen'gao*, the Three Perfected are the Perfected of Purple Yang 紫陽真人, the Perfected of Mount Tongbo 桐柏真人, and the Perfected of Pure Vacuity 清虛真人 (2.7b).

³⁸ *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2. 357b13–22.

meditation. Then he cites a number of bits of evidence from the *Declarations of the Perfected* and other Shangqing scriptures to show that there is a fundamental identity between the two religions, that Daoist practitioners have Buddhist disciples, etc. I have accounted for these references in the footnotes. The most mysterious of these references, though, is the phrase “Yuhuang Liuqin” 玉皇留秦. As Wang Jiakui suggests, Liuqin is an abbreviated reference to Krakucchanda, fourth of the seven Buddhas of the past, more commonly known in later translations as “拘留孫佛,” but transliterated in early texts as “拘留秦佛.”³⁹ Most importantly, he was the first Buddha of our kalpa cycle, making him a cosmic deity on a par with the Grand Thearch Jade Luminary 玉皇大帝.⁴⁰ Asserting the identity of these two deities was meant to demonstrate that Buddhism was but a foreign form of Daoism.⁴¹

Yet another gloss by Tao Hongjing, to the first of the (1) passages listed above, tells us just what this meditation has to do with Buddhist ideas:

[XSJ] 人體有尊神，其居無常，展轉榮輸，流注元津。此神外來，內結以立一身，非如三魂七魄，是積靈受炁，生於父母者也。

(陶注) 魂魄皆因父母之津，化胞絡以相成也。陽清以成魂，陰濁以結魄，非假外物矣。至於大神，則為司命之所詮，玄精之所配，昔是破冢之遺爽，今注此胎以成人，所謂先身者是也。今我一身，魂魄是父母之分神，形骨是五行所造作，百神是天靈所營匠，智欲是炁候所浸治。至於壽命生死，貧富貴賤，運分多少，罪福善惡，及輪迴五道，既□□□滅，必是此一大神耳。人人有之而皆不能自知也。

³⁹ See Jan Nattier, *Once Upon a Future Time: Studies in a Buddhist Prophecy of Decline* (Berkeley: Asian Humanities Press, 1991), 19–20. For early translations using the transliteration “Juliqinfo,” see Dharmarakṣa 竺法護 (fl. ca. 266–308), *Sheng jing* 生經 (T.154), 3.78a and Zhi Qian 支謙 (fl. 220–241), *Fo shuo laonüren jing* 佛說老女人經 (T.559), 14.912b.

⁴⁰ His name may have made him attractive as well. He “remained behind in the Qin” unlike Laozi, I guess. The name at any rate hints at the “conversion of barbarians” 化胡說.

⁴¹ Interestingly, the same phrase shows up in the response of Lu Xiujing 陸修靜 to a question about Buddhism. *Sandong zhunang* 三洞珠囊, 2.3b, citing the *Daoxue zhuan* 道學傳.

Within the human body, there is a venerated spirit. Its residence is not fixed. It expands and revolves, grows vigorous and fades, flowing to irrigate with primal liquids. This spirit comes from outside [the body], but fastens itself within to establish the whole body. It is not like the three cloudsouls or the seven whitesouls. These latter are an assemblage of numinous powers that receive *qi* and were born from one's father and mother.

[Tao note:] The cloudsouls and whitesouls all come from the fluids of the father and mother and are formed with the transformations of the placental webbing. *Yang* is clear and forms the cloudsouls; *yin* is turbid and knots to form the whitesouls. These do not depend on outside things. As for the Great Spirit, it is selected by the Director of Destiny and attached [to the body] through mystic essences. Formerly it was an errant light that broke out of the tomb and now it infuses this fetus to form the person. It is what is called the "former life." Now in my entire body, the cloudsouls and whitesouls are divided out from my parents; my form and bones are created by the five phases; the hundred spirits [of my body] are crafted by Celestially Numinous spirits; and my knowledge and desires are controlled by infusions of *qi* states. But when it comes to my longevity, my birth and death dates, my status, my fate, my karmic inheritance, even my rebirth into the five paths and up to — — — all of this is necessarily due to the Great Spirit. Everyone has a Great Spirit. They just do not know of it.⁴²

Tao writes that the Great Spirit is selected for incorporation into the body by the Director of Destiny and is an "errant light" 遺爽, a bit of soul matter that leaks from a tomb to be infused in the womb as the fetus is taking shape there.⁴³ He accounts as well for the other gods of the body. The *hun* and *po* come from the parents and the "one hundred spirits" are fashioned by their celestial counterparts. The physical aspects of the body, including functions such as knowledge and desire and most of the spirits which motivate it all come from things existing in our world. It might seem strange that "spirits" inhabiting the body and outside it are

⁴² *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2.357b2–9.

⁴³ For a fascinating study that touches on the ways in which the souls of the dead were imagined as light, see Henri Maspero, "Le mot *ming* 明," *Journal Asiatique* 223 (1933): 249–296.

physical, but this is the way early Chinese thought of them. Only the Great Spirit derives from a foreign source, yet it is responsible for much of what distinguishes the individual—length of life, wealth and social status, amount of luck, propensity to sin, and even rebirth destination.

The surprising answer to why this text had to be rewritten is that its meditation was intended to remake the practitioner's embryo to prepare him or her for *rebirth*. Every person has a "great spirit" that makes them who they are, but only Daoists possessing this meditation know the nine names the spirit takes as it directs the growth of the fetus and can use this knowledge to prepare themselves for rebirth.

That Tao is correct in his analysis is clear from the final passages of this text describing how a practitioner's body is guarded by the Nine Perfected after death, when he or she passes through the underworld. This passage was left almost intact by the redactor, but makes little sense in version (3) as it now stands.⁴⁴

III. Conclusions

These two fragments point to a rather disturbing fact. Although we have attempted to construct an orderly history of Daoism from the textual record, that record itself has been altered in ways that confound our attempts. I have argued elsewhere that early Lingbao texts were edited during the sixth and seventh centuries to remove offensive Buddho-Daoist material. But the picture that we have drawn of a Shangqing Daoism also relatively free of Buddhist borrowings now must be reconsidered.⁴⁵ The presence of Buddhist revisionings is a likely reason that only three of the twenty-four chapters of Tao Hongjing's *Concealed Instructions* survive today. This ability to alter the textual record is perhaps to be expected from a culture that has so involved itself with and venerated

⁴⁴ Compare *Xingshi jue*, ZH ed., 2.360a with DZ 1376, 1.10a.

⁴⁵ This claim began with Erik Zürcher's first survey of Buddhist elements in Daoist scripture in his "Buddhist Influence on Early Taoism," and was underlined by Isabelle Robinet, *La révélation*, 1:104.

textuality in all of its forms.⁴⁶ It is an aspect of Chinese culture that we have all too frequently ignored. Instead, we regularly commit the following sorts of errors in treating the scriptures of the Ming *Daoist Canon*: (1) We claim that the definition of “scripture” was immutable, so that discrete texts in the fifteenth century look just like those of the fourth. (2) We assume that uniformity in a textual record is warrant of authenticity, when in fact it might more easily be a sign of later editorial meddling. (3) We imagine that citations in later collectanea are enough to attest to the authenticity of texts written centuries earlier. The alterations worked on the *Jiuzhen zhongjing* between Tao’s writing around 500 or so and the completion of the *Wushang miyao* around 580 indicate clearly enough the unreliability of this method.

For these reasons, we need to develop a new approach to Daoist texts. One productive avenue might be to collect and analyze passages like those that I have isolated here to see what can be learned about how Daoist editors worked. For instance, the passage from *Jiuzhen zhongjing* that mentions rebirth while the rest of the scripture is innocent of the concept should have been enough to alert me that something more was involved in this meditation practice.⁴⁷ Only through some such renewed effort to employ a more precise form of textual criticism, joined with other forms of historical study, can we begin to understand the intricacies of Daoist history.

⁴⁶ For another iteration of this point, see Stephen R. Bokenkamp, “Scriptures New and Old: Lu Xiuqing and Mastery,” in *Papers from the Fourth International Conference on Sinology: Belief, Practice and Cultural Adaptation* 第四屆國際漢學會議論文集：信仰、實踐與文化調適, ed. Paul Katz and Liu Shu-Fen (Taipei: Academia Sinica, 2013), 2:449–474.

⁴⁷ In fact, I published my views on the *Jiuzhen zhongjing* without performing this necessary first step. See Stephen R. Bokenkamp, “Simple Twists of Fate? The Daoist Body and Its *Ming*,” *mea culpa*.

陶弘景著作中的佛教因素

柏夷

摘要

本研究報告提供了兩點證據，要求我們應重新考慮過去被認為是正確的觀點，即道經大量借用佛教元素的情形最早出現於五世紀初的靈寶經中。本文中列舉的兩個例子表明（佛教的）輪迴觀以及由其他諸多世界體系所組成的大宇宙不僅出現在陶弘景的著作中，也可見於由他所收集並註解的上清經裏。對研究道教的現代學者們來說，「壞」消息是本研究報告中所列舉的例子也表明——早在六世紀末，道教徒已經開始系統性地剔除其經典中所借用的佛教因素。

關鍵詞：陶弘景、佛教、上清經、文獻學、敦煌